



Government of India  
National Commission for Scheduled Tribes  
(A Constitutional Commission set up under Art. 338A  
of the Constitution of India)

File No. CM/3/2016/MFIN9/SEOTH/RU-IV

24.08.2016

To,

*DB*  
The Chairperson,  
State Bank of India,  
State Bank Bhawan,  
Madame Cama Road,  
Mumbai - 400021  
(Maharashtra)

**Sub: Representation of Smt. Caroline Minj, C-716, Delhi Govt. Flats, Timarpur regarding harassment, discrimination and victimizing Scheduled Tribe employee of State Bank of India.**

Sir,

I am directed to enclose a copy of the Proceeding of the Sitting held in the NCST on 28.07.2016 on the above mentioned subject for necessary action. The Hon'ble Vice-Chairperson has mentioned in the Proceedings that he would hear the Chairperson of the State Bank of India, Mumbai on **30.08.2016 at 5.00 P.M.** in the Commission.

I am therefore to request you to kindly attend the Sitting fixed, in person on the above date and time. Petitioner Smt. Caroline Minj may also be asked to be present in the Commission.

Yours faithfully,

*DB Kumbhare*  
(D.S. Kumbhare)  
Under Secretary  
Ph. No. 24657271  
*29/8/2016*

Copy for information and necessary action to:-

The General Manager,  
State Bank of India,  
Human Resources Deptt.,  
13<sup>th</sup> Floor, Local Head Office,  
11, Sansad Marg,  
New Delhi.

Copy to:

Ms. Caroline Minj,  
C-716, Delhi Govt. Flats,  
Timarpur,

Delhi - 110 054. - may also be present in the Commission on the above dated  
and time.

*D.S. Kumbhare*  
**(D.S. Kumbhare)**  
**Under Secretary**  
**Ph. No. 24657271**

**NATIONAL COMMISSION FOR SCHEDULED TRIBES**

**CM/3/2016/MFIN9/SEOTH/RU-IV**

**Proceedings of the sitting chaired by Hon'ble Vice-Chairperson, NCST, Government of India on 28.07.2016 at 11.00 A.M. in the petition filed by Smt. Caroline Minj, Ex-Assistant Manager, State Bank of India, Vasant Vihar, New Delhi regarding harassment, discrimination and victimization by SBI authorities.**

---

Date of sitting: 28.07.2016

List of officers present in the sitting is at **Annexure-1**.

A representation received on 07.05.2016 from Smt. Caroline Minj, Ex-Assistant Manager, State Bank of India, Vasant Vihar, New Delhi regarding harassment, discrimination and victimizing by the bank authorities by establishing false and fabricated charge sheet, which was substantiated with illegal and irrelevant evidences and her service has been dismissed. Her appeal and review petition were also rejected.

She has also mentioned that, without serving show cause notice by the Disciplinary Authority charge sheet was served. No show cause notice or any explanation was called by any authority during her posting in the branch from 24.04.1997 to 15.02.1999, whereas daily checking and cross checking are done at various level as per banking norms with all the relevant vouchers, documents and records by the responsible Incharge of the alleged accounts under the supervision of the Branch Manager / Chief Manager before closing the branch at the end of the day, which is mandatory. She has also alleged that, she was not given fair chance to defend herself to the charges leveled against her by not providing relevant records on her requisition. Besides, annual increment was not released to her as well as without to her notice after her transfer from the branch bank has debited amount from her account.



रवि ठाकुर/RAVI THAKUR  
उपाध्यक्ष/Vice Chairperson  
राष्ट्रीय अनुसूचित जनजाति आयोग  
National Commission for Scheduled Tribes  
भारत सरकार/Govt. of India  
नई दिल्ली/New Delhi

It has been noted that, charge sheet was established for the entire period of her posting at SBI, Vasant Vihar Branch, New Delhi, which was only served after two years after her transfer from the branch and suspension. The dismissal order is not the speaking order. It has also been noted that, withdrawal of seven months salary amount since her joining at Vasant Vihar branch has been alleged that those amounts are from unauthorized sources and substantiated with illegal evidences to dismiss her service is extremely serious action. Besides, it has also been noted that the Presenting Officer and the Inquiring Authority in their reports have disclosed on the basis of illegal Easi Data Reports that her Password was used which is not visible anywhere in those Easi Data Reports and the authorities have accepted the version of the Presenting Officer's and the Inquiring Authority's report to dismiss her service and rejecting the appeal and review petition.

The Commission took up the matter with the General Manager, State Bank of India, Local Head Office, New Delhi vide letter dated 10.05.2016. A reply was received on 26.07.2016.

The matter came up for hearing before the Hon'ble Vice Chairperson, NCST on 28.07.2016 at 11.00 A.M. to discuss the matter with the General Manager, State Bank of India, Local Head Office, New Delhi to redress the grievances of the Scheduled Tribe officer.

On behalf of State Bank of India, Local Head Office, New Delhi General Manager, Deputy General Manager and other officials appeared before the Commission. On discussion, the Commission desired to know about the proof of notice served by the Disciplinary Authority for explanation sought from the Petitioner and the rules as well as procedures followed by the Bank in the case. Representatives of SBI failed to produce the documents of explanation sought from the petitioner in respect of charges framed on the petitioner. The Officers present in the hearing could not give satisfactory reply to any of the clarifications sought by the Hon'ble Vice Chairperson. They came with no preparation and without any original documents, which has been viewed very serious by the Commission. As by doing so

the authorities of State Bank of India have wasted the time of all the stake holders including the officers of SBI.

Accordingly, it was decided that the case will be heard on **30.08.2016 at 5.00 PM** which will be attended personally by the Chairperson, State Bank of India with following original documents:-

1. All the original debit and credit vouchers relating to office accounts as listed in charge No. 1 and Annexure -'A'. Debit and Credit vouchers of Savings Bank Account No. 13122 of dated 03.08.1998 and 15.07.1998 as in charge No. 5.
2. All the original 18 vouchers (Debit / Credit) relating to In-operative Accounts of Charge No. 2.
3. Original User Control Officer Register (UCO).
4. End of Day Report (EOD) of original dates from 16.02.1999 to the date of deletion of ID - CRM of the Charged Officer (Easi data showing the EOD performed by the officers).
5. Complete details of procedure in sequence along with certified copies of all the applicable Rules and Acts being adopted in disciplinary action in the case of officers which has been adopted in the case of Smt. Caroline Minj.
6. Para wise comments on each and every points of the petition / complaint filed by Smt. Caroline Minj to be furnished on or before 26.08.2016.
7. When login ID – CRM and password has been allotted to Smt. Caroline Minj to operate the computer system while posted in the SBI, Vasant Vihar Branch ?
8. When was this login ID / user ID created or generated?
9. Till which date the said login ID / user ID existed and when this login ID was deleted ?
10. Login and logout report of original dates from 16.02.1999 till the date of deletion of the login ID-CRM of Smt. Caroline Minj.
11. Copy of notice issued by Disciplinary Authority by which explanation was sought by the Bank from the petitioner in initial stage i.e. in the year 1999.
12. Copy of notices / explanation called by the Bank during her posting at Vasant Vihar Branch for the alleged charges.

**NATIONAL COMMISSION FOR SCHEDULED TRIBES**

**CM/3/2016/MFIN9/SEOTH/RU-IVAnnexure-1**

**List of participants**

**NCST**

1. Shri Ravi Thakur, Hon'ble Vice-Chairperson (In chair)
2. Shri P.V. Mohandas, PS to VC
3. Shri D.S. Kumbhare, Under Secretary
4. Shri S.P. Meena, Assistant Director
5. Shri R.S. Misra, Investigator

**Officers of State Bank of India, Local Head Office, New Delhi**

1. Shri S.P. Singh, GM
2. Shri S.C. Jatav, DGM
3. Shri Vipin Chopra

**Petitioner**

Smt. Caroline Minj

Copy to :-

(1) Director (Admn, RU-III & RU-IV), Under Secretary (RU-I & RU-II), All Units of Head quarter, Director/Assistant Director/Research Officer of Regional Offices of NCST

✓ (2) SSA, NIC