

File No. AS/3/2015/MHFW1/SEOTH/RU-III

Proceedings of the Sitting taken by the Chairperson, NCST on 22.04.2015 in the matter of Miss Anubhuti Singh regarding harassment to Scheduled Tribes (reserved) Medical Students by Head of Department of Pathology of Maulana Azad College, University of Delhi.

Date of Sitting: 22.04.2015

List of the officers present: (Annex- I)

Complaint dated 15.04.2015 was submitted by Miss Anubhuti Singh, Medical Student, Maulana Azad Medical College regarding harassment to ST students (Reserved students) by Head of Department of Pathology viz. increase of fail percentage in Pathology subject and not following the procedure for supplementary examination etc.

2. Taking cognizance of above, the Commission decided to investigate/enquire into the matter and issued notice to Vice-Chancellor and Registrar, University of Delhi and Dean, Maulana Azad Medical College to discuss the issues on 22.04.2015.

3. The Dean of Maulana Azad Medical College and on behalf of Vice Chancellor of Delhi University, Joint Registrar appeared before the Commission. The Dean of Maulana Azad Medical College vide letter dated 22.04.2015 **(as at Annexure - II)** submitted the information/clarifications on the points raised by the Commission in the matter.

4. The father of petitioner was given opportunity to explain the case, since his daughter Miss. Anubhuti Singh was reported to be under depression. He explained that her daughter and other SC/ST/OBC category students have been harassed by the Head of Department, Pathology in Maulana Azad Medical College, University of Delhi.

5. The Commission enquired about the system, mechanism and the procedure followed by Medical Colleges about attendance shortage of students i.e. whether parents or students were informed on time about short comings and whether extra classes were conducted to improve the level of weak students and bridge the gap of short attendance etc.

*Rameshwar Oraon*

8. The Dean of the Faculty of Medical Sciences College said that attendance of 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> professional courses are put up on web site. It was also informed that special classes are conducted. However with regard to these students, Dean will check up again and submit the report.

7. After Sitting both sides, Commission observed that:-

- (a) Data of result of last 05 years Pathology students shows that in Professional exam of 2014, more than 94% students of reserved category got supplementary whereas in 2010 & 2011, 50% belong to the general category got supplementary and in February 2015, 90% students declared as failed belongs to SC/ST/OBC/Ph. Category {in 2014 total 34 students got supplementary and category-wise as below, 04-General (2-Ph.), 08-ST, 04-SC, 18-OBC} {in February 2015, 20 students failed General-02, ST-04, SC-03, OBC-11}.
- (b) Petitioner submitted that she was informed only 02 days before beginning of main university examination about the shortage of attendance when she went to collect the admit card. She was never informed about her shortage of attendance in past. Her attendance was full for requirement for appearing in the other 03 subjects.
- (c) that the Delhi University exam rules do not debar to attend the classes at 3<sup>rd</sup> Professional rules states Delhi University (c) "A student who fails in the 2<sup>nd</sup> Professional Examination, shall not be allowed to appear in 3<sup>rd</sup> Professional Part-I Examination unless he passes in all subjects of 2<sup>nd</sup> Professional Examination".
- (d) that recently, Delhi University held re-examination of pediatrics and in past, Microbiology of 2<sup>nd</sup> Professional and MD Medicine re-examination.

8. The Joint Director of examination mentioned that he was not aware of cases of re-examinations held by University but would certainly check up with University of Delhi. The Dean informed that representation of students vide letter No. 402(2)/2013/MC(Aca)/6034-36 dated 08.04.2015 has been sent to Dean, Faculty of Medical Sciences to consider the students for re-examination, as per practice followed in the past by the University.

9. That Prima facie there is a substance in the complaint filed by the petitioner and Commission felt that it is necessary to hold inquiry

*Rameshwar Oraon*

... as reported that 01 student of SC has died in MAMC hostel last year and another student made an attempt to suicide in March 2015 itself who was failing in Pathology subject continuously for last 02 years.

10. The Commission advised the Dean, Maulana Azad Medical College/University of Delhi to allow the students to attend the 3<sup>rd</sup> Professional Courses Classes as per rules and also consider the students to write re-examination as per practice in the past to save the career of 20 reserved category candidates.

*Rameshwar Oraon*

**Dr. RAMESHWAR ORAON**  
Chairman  
National Commission for Scheduled Tribes  
Govt. of India  
New Delhi

**List of participants**

**NCST**

1. Dr. Rameshwar Oraon, Hon'ble Chairperson (In chair)
2. Mrs. K.D. Bhansor, Director
3. Shri N. Balasubramanian, Research Officer

**Officers of University of Delhi**

Dr. Vikas Gupta, Joint Registrar

**Officers of Maulana Azad Medical College**

1. Dr. Deepak Tempe, Dean
2. Dr. N.S. Hadke, Academic Officer

**Petitioner**

Miss Anubhuti Singh (not present)

Shri R.C. Meena, father of petitioner represented for petitioner.



Maulana Azad Medical College  
2-Bahadur Shah Zafar Marg, New Delhi-110002  
(Academic Section)

No.F.402(30) 2015/MC(Aca)/ 7534

Dated: 22-04-2015

To.

✓The Director  
National Commission for Scheduled Tribes  
6<sup>th</sup> Floor, 'B' Wing, Lok Nayak Bhawan,  
Khan market, New Delhi - 110003.

Sub:- Representation dated 15.04.2015 from Miss Anubhuti Singh, Medical Student, Delhi regarding harassment to Scheduled Tribes Medical Students of Maulana Azad Medical College by Head of the Department of Pathology.

Madam,

Kindly refer to your notice no. AS/3/2015/MHFW1/SEOTH/RU-III dated 17.04.2015 on the subject cited above. In this connection it is submitted that Maulana Azad Medical College is a State owned College under the Administrative control of the Govt. Of NCT of Delhi. The college is affiliated with the University of Delhi. The examination process is completely within the ambit of University of Delhi and this college conducts examination to Undergraduate/ Post Graduate Courses on behalf of the University of Delhi.

The point wise reply/ information as asked for in the annexure -1 of the aforesaid letter is as under:-

1. Category wise(ST/SC/OBC/PH and unreserved) list of students who got supplementary and failed in the Pathology subject in last 5 years, is attached.(Annex - A)

2. The details of marks of students of Internal Assessment are forwarded to the Delhi University after receipt from the concerned Curriculum Committee and duly approved by the Competent Authority. After the Theory examination, the marks obtained by the students in practical, Oral and Viva are also forwarded to the University of Delhi by the concerned Department.

3. As a matter of practice, attendance of the student is marked by the Teacher in the attendance register for every subject and for every class. One Faculty Member is a Nodal Officer/ Class In-charge for maintaining the attendance. The attendance is compiled for all types of classes as mentioned in the Graduate Medical Education Regulation, 2003 published in the Gazette of India Part - III, Section - 4 Extraordinary issued dated 30.09.2003, notified by the Medical Council of India dated 15.10.2003(Annex - B) which stipulates as under:-

**In regulation 12,-**

(i) **Attendance: 75% attendance in a subject for appearing in the examination is compulsory inclusive of attendance in non - lecture teaching, i.e. seminars, group**

35 marks in internal marks and 15 marks in assessment in a particular subject in order to be eligible to appear in final university examination of that subject.

Further there is curriculum committee constituted for each professional examination. The curriculum committee consists of HODs of the subject for which the students are eligible to appear exam. The committee goes through the attendance and internal assessment of the students. The students who do not fulfill the eligibility criteria are recommended for detention and are not allowed to appear in the examination.

4. Rules and Guidelines laid down by the Medical Council of India and University of Delhi are scrupulously adhered to by the College in case of those students who have short attendance. The college keeps a vigil on such problems and arrangements are made to solve them. In this connection circular dated 30.12.2014 refers vide which orders with regard to extra classes for the students to over come their deficiencies of attendance, have been issued. **(Annex - C)**

5. Maulana Azad Medical College including the Department of Pathology, does conduct the special classes for students who fail. **(Annex - D)**


6. There is no such records available with the College. However, in Maulana Azad Medical College, the student who has failed in 2<sup>nd</sup> Prof. is allowed to attend classes of 3<sup>rd</sup> Prof.

7. Dr. Shyama Lata, HOD(Pathology) is a member of CHS and her ACR record is available with the Govt. of India, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare.

8. As submitted, above the records of the result are available with the University of Delhi.

In view of the above it is submitted that the examination process is completely within the ambit of University of Delhi and the college conducts examination on its behalf after scrupulously adhering to the rules and guidelines issued by the Medical Council of India and University of Delhi in its letter and spirit. Therefore, it is requested that the notice issued may please be withdrawn.

Encl: As above

  
21-4-15  
(Dr. Deepak K. Tempe)  
Dean